

Principles of Distributive Justice

GRZEGORZ LISSOWSKI

Principles of Distributive Justice

Translated by Tomasz Bigaj

Barbara Budrich Publishers • Scholar Publishing House

Opladen • Berlin • Toronto • Warsaw 2013

Copyright © 2008 by Wydawnictwo Naukowe Scholar, Warsaw
Copyright © 2013 for the English edition by Wydawnictwo Naukowe Scholar,
Warsaw
Copyright © 2013 for the English edition by Verlag Barbara Budrich/Barbara
Budrich Publishers, Opladen, Berlin & Toronto

Based on the Polish edition:
Zasady sprawiedliwego podziału dóbr (2008)

The book is subsidised by the Polish Minister of Science and Higher Education
within the scope of the National Programme for the Development of Humanities
2012-2013



**NARODOWY PROGRAM
ROZWOJU HUMANISTYKI**

Proofread by Mairead Collins
Cover design by Katarzyna Juras

ISBN 978-83-7383-603-7
ISBN 978-3-8474-0092-9

Typeset by Inter Esse

Scholar Publishing House
ul. Krakowskie Przedmieście 62
00-322 Warszawa, Poland
info@scholar.com.pl
www.scholar.com.pl

Verlag Barbara Budrich/Barbara Budrich Publishers
Stauffenbergstr. 7, 51379 Leverkusen-Opladen, Germany

86 Delma Drive, Toronto, ON M8W 4P6 Canada
www.barbara-budrich.net
info@barbara-budrich.net

LIST OF CHAPTERS

Preface.....	13
Part I. Basic concepts	
1. Introduction.....	17
1*. Relations and their properties	27
2. The division of goods and their individual evaluations	34
2*. Preferences and utilities	55
Part II. Types of social evaluations	
3. Social evaluations of goods divisions	69
3*. The bases for establishing social evaluations of divisions.....	81
4. Three types of distributive justice principles	89
4*. Base criteria of social evaluations.....	115
Part III. Equality	
5. Equal shares or equal utilities?	135
5*. Properties of egalitarian principles	165
6. Klemens Szaniawski's probabilistic equality rules.....	181
6*. Fair lotteries	206
Part IV. Impartiality	
7. The construction and justification of the classical principles of justice	219
7*. Axiomatic comparisons of the classical principles of justice	248
8. New versus classical principles of justice and individuals' choices in experimental situations	259
8*. The generalised Rawlsian and conservative principles of justice.....	303
Part V. Unanimity	
9. Games of fair division.....	317
9*. Solutions of goods division games	330
10. Fair procedures.....	335
10*. Properties of allocation procedures.....	345
Part VI. Summary	
11. Conclusion	351
Bibliography	359
Name Index	373
Subject Index	377

CONTENTS

PREFACE	13
---------------	----

Part I. BASIC CONCEPTS

1. INTRODUCTION	17
1.1. Distributive justice	17
1.2. Global and local distributive justice	19
1.3. Distributive justice problems in the social sciences	20
1.4. The book's goals and overview	22
1*. RELATIONS AND THEIR PROPERTIES	27
1*1. Notation	27
1*2. Binary relations.....	28
1*3. Properties of binary relations.....	28
1*4. Basic types of binary relations.....	29
1*5. Extensions of binary relations and the compatibility of two relations	30
1*6. Maximal and optimal set, choice function.....	31
2. THE DIVISION OF GOODS AND THEIR INDIVIDUAL EVALUATIONS	34
2.1. Kinds of goods.....	34
2.2. Division of goods.....	35
2.3. Division of homogenous and divisible goods.....	36
2.4. Division of a set of indivisible goods	38
2.5. Random methods of allocation	39
2.6. Individual preferences.....	41
2.7. Subjective preferences	42
2.8. Cardinal utilities.....	44
2.9. The utility of one homogeneous and divisible good.....	47
2.10. The utilities of two homogeneous and divisible goods.....	48
2.11. Divisions and their utilities	49
2.12. Extended preferences and utilities	50
2.13. Global preferences and utilities	51
2.14. Preferences for indivisible goods and their divisions	53

2*. PREFERENCES AND UTILITIES	55
2*1. General characterisation of the division of goods	55
2*2. Deterministic and random methods of the allocation of goods	56
2*3. Subjective and extended preferences	57
2*4. Ordinal and cardinal utilities	58
2*5. Global evaluations of the division of goods	62
2*6. Types of goods and the differences among individual evaluations of goods	63

Part II. TYPES OF SOCIAL EVALUATIONS

3. SOCIAL EVALUATIONS OF GOODS DIVISIONS	69
3.1. Social evaluations of divisions	69
3.2. Principles of distributive justice	70
3.3. Individual principles of distributive justice	71
3.4. The problem of the mutual consistency of extended individual preferences	73
3.5. Invariance axioms: the measurability and comparability of individual utility functions	73
3.6. Differences among social distributive evaluations	78
3*. THE BASES FOR ESTABLISHING SOCIAL EVALUATIONS OF DIVISIONS	81
3*1. Relations of social distributive evaluation	81
3*2. Social welfare and social choice functionals	83
3*3. Sen's axioms of individual preference consistency	85
3*4. Invariance axioms	86
4. THREE TYPES OF DISTRIBUTIVE JUSTICE PRINCIPLES	89
4.1. Types of justification of distributive justice principles	89
4.2. Equality	91
4.3. Impartiality	96
4.4. Unanimity	104
4.5. Connections among the three types of justice principles	112
4*. BASE CRITERIA OF SOCIAL EVALUATIONS	115
4*1. The Pareto optimality relation	115
4*2. The equalisation relation and selected egalitarian principles of justice	116
4*3. Suppes's justice relation and selected impartial principles of justice	121
4*4. The acceptance relation and selected unanimous principles of justice	126
4*5. Connections among the three base relations of justice	131

Part III. EQUALITY

5. EQUAL SHARES OR EQUAL UTILITIES?	135
5.1. Equality	135
5.2. Equality of shares and the criteria of dominance	135
5.3. Egalitarian equivalent allocations	142
5.4. Non-envy and the principles of distributive justice	147
5.5. Envy and the exchange of goods	157
5.6. Attempts to combine equality and efficiency	162
5*. PROPERTIES OF EGALITARIAN PRINCIPLES	165
5*1. Lorenz dominance and other criteria of dominance	165
5*2. The Pazner-Schmeidler principle	168
5*3. Non-envy principles of goods allocation	171
5*4. The Walras principle of competitive equilibrium	177
5*5. The Goldman-Sussangkarn principle and its modifications	178
6. KLEMENS SZANIAWSKI'S PROBABILISTIC EQUALITY RULES	181
6.1. Random methods of social decision-making	181
6.2. The assumptions of Szaniawski's two probabilistic principles	182
6.3. The equal satisfaction principle	184
6.4. Equality of satisfaction vs. optimality	186
6.5. The principle of equal chances of choice	188
6.6. A comparison of the two probabilistic equality principles	190
6.7. Szaniawski's principles and the postulates of proportionality and non-envy	193
6.8. An experimental study of Szaniawski's equality principles	197
6.9. Probabilistic equality rules when the subjective utilities are known ...	204
6*. FAIR LOTTERIES	206
6*1. The properties of the random division of a set of indivisible goods ..	206
6*2. Klemens Szaniawski's two probabilistic equality principles	212
6*3. The probabilistic serial rule	214

Part IV. IMPARTIALITY

7. THE CONSTRUCTION AND JUSTIFICATION OF THE CLASSICAL PRINCIPLES OF JUSTICE	219
7.1. Impartiality	219
7.2. Three models of the original position	221
7.3. Decision theory in the justification of choices in the original position	226
7.4. Justification of the utilitarian principle: the model of the impartial observer	228

7.5. Justification of the utilitarian principle: Harsanyi's axiomatic model	233
7.6. Justification of Rawls's principle: Strasnick's theorems	237
7.7. Justification of Rawls's principle: Hammond's theorems	243
7.8. The utilitarian social welfare function vs. Arrow's theorem	246
7*. AXIOMATIC COMPARISONS OF THE CLASSICAL PRINCIPLES OF JUSTICE	248
7*1. Early comparisons of the classical principles of justice	248
7*2. The utilitarians' principle vs. Rawls's leximin: the theorems of d'Aspremont and Gevers	252
7*3. The utilitarians' principle vs. Rawls's leximin: Maskin's theorem	254
7*4. Restrictions on the set of justice principles: the theorems of Deschamps and Gevers	255
8. NEW VERSUS CLASSICAL PRINCIPLES OF JUSTICE AND INDIVIDUALS' CHOICES IN EXPERIMENTAL SITUATIONS	259
8.1. Principles of justice and individuals' choices and evaluations	259
8.2. Sayeki and Tomiyama's study: the consistency of choices with utilitarian and egalitarian principles	260
8.3. The experiment "Evaluations and Choices": social welfare functions vs. empirical strategies	264
8.4. The distributive justice representation of the social choice problem	268
8.5. Classical principles of justice vs. empirical choices	272
8.6. Generalised principles of fair choice and their validity	277
8.7. Generalised principles of the evaluation of fairness	286
8.8. The empirical adequacy of the generalised principles of fairness	288
8.9. Evaluations from the point of view of an impartial observer and of a participant in the division	295
8.10. Ordering distributive justice principles	301
8*. THE GENERALISED RAWLSIAN AND CONSERVATIVE PRINCIPLES OF JUSTICE	303
8*1. The Kemeny-Snell distance measure between preferential rankings	303
8*2. The normative foundations of the Kemeny-Snell distance measure	304
8*3. Generalised principles of fair choice and their properties	307
8*4. Generalised principles of justice evaluation and their properties	312
8*5. A comparison of the generalised Rawlsian and conservative principles of fair evaluation and choice	313

Part V. UNANIMITY

9. GAMES OF FAIR DIVISION	317
9.1. Games of goods division	317
9.2. The Nash bargaining solution	319
9.3. Principles of justice connected with the Nash solution	323
9.4. The Kalai-Smorodinsky solution, its modifications and the principle of fairness	326
9.5. Other solutions of goods division games.....	328
9*. SOLUTIONS OF GOODS DIVISION GAMES.....	330
9*1. Generalisations and modifications of Nash's solution.....	330
9*2. The Kalai-Smorodinsky solution and the lexicographic maximin	332
10. FAIR PROCEDURES.....	335
10.1. Procedures of goods allocation.....	335
10.2. Negotiations.....	335
10.3. Desirable properties of the procedures	336
10.4. Classical procedures of fair allocation.....	338
10.5. Selected procedures of division choice.....	341
10*. PROPERTIES OF ALLOCATION PROCEDURES	345
10*1. Theorems on negotiations.....	345
10*2. Theorems on the properties of selected procedures.....	347

Part VI. SUMMARY

11. CONCLUSION	351
11.1. The functions of distributive justice principles.....	351
11.2. The bases of distributive judgements.....	352
11.3. Methods of constructing and justifying distributive justice principles	353
11.4. The importance of empirical studies.....	355
BIBLIOGRAPHY	359
NAME INDEX	373
SUBJECT INDEX	377